Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review
www.plhr.org.pk

**RESEARCH PAPER**

# Comparative Study of Novice and Experienced Elementary Teachers Use of Pedagogical Methods in Punjab

Lazar Paul [1] Dr. Muhammad Hameed Nawaz [2]

1. Ph.D Scholar, Department of Education, University of Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Professor, Department of Education, University of Lahore, Punjab, Pakistan

**DOI** http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2021(5-II)2.6

**PAPER INFO**

**Received:**
May 28, 2021
**Accepted:**
September 04, 2021
**Online:**
September 06, 2021

**Keywords:**
Classroom Management
Pedagogical Methods,
Experienced and Novice Teacher

***Corresponding Author**

lazarpauls@gmail.com

**ABSTRACT**

This research was accomplished using descriptive and comparative survey method. The population of research was 3905 elementary school educators in Gujranwala division. Simple random sampling technique was applied through a checklist approved and validated by research committee. The checklist enabled to collect data from 195 educators chosen as samples, out of which 121 were experienced teachers and 74 were novice. It is observed which pedagogical methods, they used. Statistical package used for social sciences (SPSS version 20.0), for the organization, coding and analyses of the collected data. Inferential statistics was used to analyze the data, and descriptive statistics to compute frequency and deduce percentage for responses. ANOVA, Independent sample t-test, One-sample t-test, and Chi-square tests were applied to analyze the data. It is found that, experienced educators use time-wait, chunking, advance organizer and classroom management techniques more than novice teachers.

## Introduction

Anyone with intellect and observation cannot deny the fact that we are living in an era in which information is considered more precious than silver and gold and it would not be an overstatement to proclaim this era as the age of information and technology. Yenice (2011) points out that Science with its progress accompanied by technology are the areas that demand workforce which must be equipped with different set of skills than their predecessors. individuals who are mature, attentive to fluctuating social development, capable of thinking, decision making and problem solving; those that are not held back by the human needs or are intimidated by the pressures of their relative fields are going to be in demand. To accommodate the requirements of modern and progressive industries everywhere, prime importance is given to cognition.

Let us not make the gruesome mistake of taking the field of education out of the sphere of those modern and progressive industries. An educator after all is producing, skilled individuals with a potential to contribute in the wellbeing and progress of their country, much like any other manufacturer. Itis therefore, of an utmost value that an educator's cognition must be taken in to account. An educator's cognition is an indicator of a teacher's practical approach to teaching. Cognitive agility and ability to communicate define the core values of the profession. It is worth emphasizing it yet again that cognitive agility especially ability to think on one's feet is a valuable merit, one that makes the whole learning process worthwhile. Gatbbonton (2012) refers to educators' cognition as a skill and quite indispensable, in terms of solving pedagogical situations.

It can be explained as a triangle, if a triangle were to represent a society the base would be youth, one side is parents and the other side would be the teachers. The triangle would fail miserably to hold its shape even if one side is missing. Parents and families have a crucial role to play but educators will eventually define the moral, skill, character and attitude of a child. An educator not only teaches but judge and evaluate and their own competence determines the outcome of the school, in fact of the entire nation (Hattie, 2010). A reliable teacher who exudes wisdom, dignity, skill and kindness will win more transformed minds than a teacher who is rough, uncultured and is quick to react. It is often seen that novice educators have difficulty however temporary, to attune themselves to the requirements of the educational field. They are often seen to lack professional astuteness, which often, eventually gives way to polished and mature behavior over time.

Contributions, researches and searches, progress and additions have been made in the field of education since time immemorial but in the past few decades' scholars shifted their paradigm and focused on asking for insights or other peculiarities that educators have observed or applied; needless to say, that those insights vary as much as there are educators in the world. It is also observed that working styles, attitudes and overall performance of novice and experienced teachers differ drastically from each other. The experienced educators are found to be steadier, trustworthy and over all fuss free, as oppose to their counterparts and the primary reasons are: more exposure, to stressful demanding situations and the phenomena of retaining and eliminating that is, they have figured out what works and what wouldn't in their specific situation (Tsui, 2012). The novice educators do appear to be less stable and might even appear less efficient, however, it is not to be held against them, every master was once a beginner. as the time progress and exposure to various situations hone their skills, they master experience and do shine bright. Novice educators must seek help or whatever piece of advice they could from experienced educators that will indeed prove beneficial in their careers. It is to be understood that like everything else in nature and society, an educators' career, character and personality are evolving.

As Gathbrowth, (2014) points out that examining the thinking and behavior of experienced teacher can help and reveal as to which features of pedagogical knowledge are associated with fruitful experience.

There is plenty of evidence to support that having an experience in any field does not make one an expert (Scardamalia, 2012). There are teachers who have taught for a long time yet, they remain ineffective (Tsui, 2013), whereas, there are novices that come equip with many a trick up their sleeves. I suggest that observing and monitoring novice educators in action, that is to say, whilst they are teaching could provide some insights to the hiccups and hindrance some experienced teachers might have.

Research have shown that novice educators depend heavily on theoretical approach; meaning that they follow rules to the letter also correctly pronounced as rule-based ways of teaching by Huberman ,2013; they are more concerned with what the book says and become frustrated upon slight variation in the lecture delivery or any other fluctuation of the classroom management. It is also seen that the educator's confidence plays a key role in the execution of their professional abilities (Hattie W, 2013). Some scholars (Dewey, 1904), point out and rightly so, that there is a huge gap between what a teacher learns as part of their training and how they have to practically do it. Some novice educators have even called the experience of practical field as shocking (Tartwijk, 2014). It is not until the experience is internalized, processed and more exposure is granted that the theory and practice start to make sense (Berliner, 2015). Howard 2014, even called it as a decontextualizing of the knowledge learned during the teaching training to the classroom. Every novice teacher would have to come up with their own personalized set of skills that is specific to their situation and relevant to the needs of their students. It would be really helpful if there were to be a case and guidance database that will assist the novice educators with relevant tools and ideas (Hargreaves, 2016). Meanwhile they have to suffice with asking for help from seniors' teachers.

Let us accept the fact that our society is composed of many components and it is the need of the hour to address cultural, religious and ethical diversity. It is repeatedly brought to attention by scholars like Kincheloe, (2011) that specifically and especially elementary school educators must be made aware of critical pedagogy, to teach the young ones about social justice, equality and respect for diversity. it will be a vital step to promote and preserve our democratic values. Mc. Laren (2012) go as far as to say that teachers must objectively dissect the complexities, reasons and causes of the inequality and injustice in the society, and do so mercilessly admitting their own shortcoming in the process. The open confrontation to oppression and resistance to the established norm of accepting injustice can if only be addressed and highlighted in the schools and classrooms will bring revolution. Pedagogy in this sense goes beyond the usual transfer of knowledge and becomes alive and ever evolving like the lives of people (Berliner, C, 2014). Curriculum can be altered over time but morality and character lasts after a child has left the school.

Over the years it is noticed that novice educators find it very challenging to adjust to the work environment, the reason might be scarcity of experience or practical knowledge and that in turn make their performance less effective than their experienced counterparts.

The education department, along with the implementation of rubrics is now at the verge of introducing the National professional standards, to screen performance and accomplishment of novice and experienced educators. It is a prudent initiative to empower the regional educational system by monitoring the competency of educators, and to make them aware of what is expected of them as influencers. It is necessary that the pedagogical methods employed by educators of both categories (novice, experienced), must be addressed, along with renewal of existing methods new strategies and styles must be introduced so we can keep up with rest of the world. This research is a small effort to highlight those pedagogical methods so that we may learn from our mistakes and grow.

**Material and Methods**

It was descriptive study and survey design in the nature. The researcher used cross-sectional approach for data collection to explore pedagogical method used by novice and experienced elementary teachers. The research was conducted in 3905 elementary schools in the Gujranwala Division, out of which 1542 were intended for male students run mainly by male teachers, and 2363 were administered for female students by majority of female staff. It is interesting to note that out of the collection of 982 novice educators, 577 were female and 405 were male; while the total from experienced educator category was 2923 out of which 1786 were female and 1137 were male educators, who were teaching in elementary schools of Gujranwala.

| **Gujranwala Division=3905** | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Male=1542 | | | | Female=2363 | | | |
| Novice=405 | | Experienced=1137 | | Novice=577 | | Experienced=1786 | |
| Rural | Urban | Rural | Urban | Rural | Urban | Rural | Urban |
| 219 | 186 | 625 | 512 | 254 | 323 | 857 | 929 |
| **Novice=982** **Experience=2923** | | **Rural=1955** **Urban=1950** | | | | | |

**Data Analysis**

Inferential statistic was used to examine the following

1) Understanding the pedagogical method of each cluster (novice & experienced) as they educate their pupils and their consideration of the following:

    - T-test was applied for gender variable (independent sample)

- ANOVA was used for Academic qualification
- T-Test applied for locality (independent sample)

2) Chi-Square test for used to find out the most frequently adopted pedagogical method by educators of each cluster (novice, experienced).

3) Chi-Square test and T-Test (independent sample) were used simultaneously to monitor and compare the classroom management techniques used by educators of the novice and experienced clusters.

4) Chi-Square test and T-Test were used to compare chunking techniques used by educators of both clusters (novice and experienced) within the classroom.

**Applied pedagogical methods by novice and expert educators:**

It was observed that among the novice teacher 34.4% (67) and among experienced teachers 60.6% (118) were adopting classroom management techniques while conducting class.

10.8% novice and 60.5% experienced teachers were adopting chunking pedagogy.

7.2% novice and 58.5% experienced teachers were adopting hands-on pedagogy.

14.4% novice and 48.7% experienced teachers were adopting interactive pedagogy.

3.6% novice and 35.4% experienced teachers were adopting expository pedagogy.

3.1% novice and 19.5% experienced teachers were adopting collaborative pedagogy.

12.8% novice and 38.5% experienced teachers were adopting directive and discovery pedagogy.

1.0% novice and 13.3% experienced teachers were adopting cooperative and collaborative pedagogy.

21.5% novice and 62.1% experienced teachers were adopting time-Waite pedagogy.

23.1% novice and 6.2% experienced teachers were adopting taxonomy pedagogy.

24.1% novice and 61.0% of the experienced teachers were adopting advanced organizer pedagogy in classroom.

**Table 1**
**Frequency and percentage of the use Pedagogical methods adopted by Novice and experienced elementary school teachers; Total novice=37.9 % (74), Total experienced=62.1% (121)**

| Sr. # | Type of Pedagogies | Type of Teacher | Not Apply | Apply |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 01 | **Classroom Management Technique** | Novice | 3.6%(7) | 34.4%(67) |
| | | **Experienced** | **1.5%(3)** | **60.6%(118)** |
| 02 | **Chunking Pedagogy** | Novice | 27.2%(53) | 10.8%(21) |
| | | **Experienced** | **1.5%(3)** | **60.5%(118)** |
| 03 | Hands-on-Pedagogy | Novice | 30.8%(60) | 7.2%(14) |
| | | Experienced | 3.6%(7) | 58.5%(114) |
| 04 | Interactive Pedagogy | Novice | 23.6%(46) | 14.4%(28) |
| | | Experienced | 13.3%(26) | 48.7%(95) |
| 05 | Expository Pedagogy | Novice | 34.4%(67) | 3.6%(7) |
| | | Experienced | 26.7%(52) | 35.4%(76) |
| 06 | Collaborative Pedagogy | Novice | 34.9%(8) | 3.1%(6) |
| | | Experienced | 42.6%(83) | 19.5%(38) |
| 07 | Directive & Discovery Pedagogy | Novice | 25.1%(49) | 12.8%(25) |
| | | Experienced | 23.6%(46) | 38.5%(75) |
| 08 | Cooperative & Collaborative Pedagogy | Novice | 36.9%(72) | 1.0%(2) |
| | | Experienced | 48.7%(95) | 13.3%(26) |
| 09 | **Time-Waite Pedagogy** | **Novice** | **16.4%(32)** | **21.5%(42)** |
| | | **Experienced** | **0.0%(0)** | **62.1%(121)** |
| 10 | Use of Taxonomy (Balloon& Solo) | Novice | 24.9%(29) | 23.1%(45) |
| | | Experienced | 55.9%(109) | 6.2%(12) |
| 11 | **Advanced organizer in classroom** | **Novice** | **13.8%(27)** | **24.1%(47)** |
| | | **Experienced** | **1.0%(2)** | **61.0%(119)** |

Comparing the classroom management techniques applied and adopted by novice and experienced educators

**Educators drafted the rules and displayed them in the class:**

It was found out that educators that adopted classroom management techniques, from (60.5%) experienced and (34.4%) novice, 57.0% (112) of the experienced and 20.5% (40) of the novice teachers formulated and displayed classrooms' rules in the class by adopting classroom management technique.

57.4% (113) of the experienced and 20.0% (39) of the novice teachers establish general rules within the classroom.

58.3% of the experienced and 13.5% of the novice teachers displayed classrooms' management plan within the classroom.

It was concluded, that majority of the experienced educators took care to establish general rules, regulations and adopted various classroom management plans to promote productivity;

Novice educators, although enthusiastic and aware of rules and regulations, did not effectively implement them. The reason could be developing confidence.

**Table 2**

**Frequency and percentage of the comparison of characteristics of classroom** management technique adopted by novice and experience teachers; Experienced=118, **Novice=67**

| **Sr.#** | **Statement** | **Type of Teachers** | **Fre. & %age** | **Yes** | **No** | **Total** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **A:Teachers formulate and display classroom rules in the class** | | Experienced | Fre. | 112 | 6 | 118 |
| | | | %age | 57.0 | 3.5 | 60.5 |
| | | Novice | Fre. | 40 | 27 | 67 |
| | | | %age | 20.5 | 13.9 | 34.4 |
| 01 | Teacher establish general rules of conduct to ensure the classroom management | Experienced | Fre. | 113 | 5 | 118 |
| | | | %age | 57.4 | 3.1 | 60.5 |
| | | Novice | Fre. | 39 | 28 | 67 |
| | | | %age | 20.0 | 14.4 | 34.4 |
| 02 | Teacher has display list of classroom management plan in class | Experienced | Fre. | 114 | 4 | 118 |
| | | | %age | 58.3 | 2.2 | 60.5 |
| | | Novice | Fre. | 26 | 41 | 67 |
| | | | %age | 13.5 | 20.9 | 34.4 |

**Discussion:**

Survey and descriptive comparative method of research were made to compare the pedagogical methods implemented by novice and experienced educators in the Gujranwala division. To put it numerically, population consisted of 3905 elementary school educators; out of which 2923 were experienced, and 982 were novice teachers. Simple random sampling technique was applied to collect data from 195 elementary school educators (experienced 121, novice 74). Checklist was developed to thoroughly observe the pedagogical methods whilst which were taught in their classrooms. . Checklist was examined and approved by the experts and research committee before it was used as a standard.

After the collection of data, it was organized, coded and fed into the computer for analysis. The software which was used is analysis was Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS version 20.0). Inferential and descriptive statistics was used to analyze the data. ANOVA, Independent sample t-test, One-sample t-test, and Chi-square tests were also employed for analysis

**Conclusion**

It was found that the most adopted pedagogies are:

- classroom management technique
- chunking
- time wait
- advance organizer in classroom

These are some of the preferred and adopted pedagogical methods employed by male and female experienced teachers of the urban areas who have B.A/B.Sc. qualification. The novice teachers in the classrooms used more or less the same methods but not as frequently or mindfully as their counterparts.

After analysis of the data, it was established that the most of the adopted pedagogical methods are classroom management technique, chunking, time wait pedagogy, and advance organizer in classroom which majority of the experienced and novice teachers adopted while teaching.

After analysis it was found that majority of the experienced teachers adopted more classroom management than the novice teachers and only few novice teachers adopt this technique. By adopting the classroom management pedagogy, the both types of teachers act upon the following characteristics of each technique:

a. Teacher is formulating and display classroom rules in the class: - It was fond that majority of the experienced and few of the novice teachers established general rules and displayed.

b. To make conducive learning environment: It was analyzed that majority of the experienced. Moreover, the majority of the experienced teachers exactly while majority of novice teachers to some extent supported learning environment for positive students-teachers' relationship to inspire them to attain knowledge and skill.

C. Teacher make sure about the pedagogy of physical environment: After analysis it was fond out that, to make physical environment friendly for students to manage class, in the class of majority of the experienced and novice teachers whereas the temperature of the majority of experienced teaches classrooms was normal while the temperature of the majority of novice teaches' classrooms was not normal.

Novice teachers adopt the most classroom management pedagogy while experienced teachers adopt the most time-wait pedagogy in the classroom (Above Table showed)

There were huge differences in the individuality of classroom management technique which novice and experience teachers used. While formulating and displaying classroom rules in the class majority of the experienced and few of the novice teachers.

**Recommendation**

In the light of research finding and conclusion, the following recommendations were made to improve teaching and learning process more conducive and effective:

- Education department should arrange training to train teacher to adopt proper and use appropriately pedagogies in the classroom to make teaching and learning more effective.

- It is generally the responsibly of the government especially the education department should select teachers who had a high level of pedagogical beliefs. It is the foremost duty of the education department to revisit those Novice and experienced teachers who reported low degree performance.

**Reference**

Abid, B., H., Lederman, J. S. &Khalick, F. (2016). Teaching science in the 21st century. Alternative certification: Aspirations and realities. In J. Rhoton& P. Shane (Editors), Teaching science in the 21st Century (pp. 25-27).

Afdal, H. W., & Nerland, M. (2012). Does teacher education matter? An Analysis of Relations to Knowledge among Norwegian and Finnish Novice Teachers. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research. 2(5): 12-16*

Akyel, A., S. (2009). Experienced and student EFL teachers' instructional thoughts and actions, *Canadian Modern Language Review, 53*, 678–704

Andy, W., A., & Hargreaves, L. (2011). Teaching as a paradoxical profession: implications for professional development. In *Symposium proceedings on continuing teacher education and school development*, 26–38

Aube, H.M., & David, I., K. (2013). Bridging the gap between educational research and educational practice: The need for critical distance. *Educational Theory, 57*(1), 95-101

Babad, O., P., &Goldhaber, D. (2012). "The mystery of good teaching: surveying the evidence on student achievement and teachers' characteristics." *Education Next, 2*(1), 50–55.

Bastur, P., U. (2015). Teaching for meaningful learning: a review of research on inquiry-based and cooperative learning. *Journal of Science and Education*. 5(14), 36-41

Beijaard, S., O., &Douwe, F., I. (2016) "Assessing teachers' practical knowledge". *Studies in Educational Evaluation* 22, 3, 275–286

Bemis, D. G. (2016). *Effects of mentoring programs on new teacher retention in selectedsuburban schools.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Boston College. 6th Ed. 321-342

Berliner, C. (2014). Processing and using information about students: A study of expert, novice, and postulant teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 3, 147–157

Blossoming, A., &Alhuda, W. (2014). Supporting the improvement of learning and teaching in social and institutional context. In S. Carver & D. Klahr (Eds.), C*ognition and instruction: twenty five years of progress* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Ins. (pp. 455-478).

Borko, O., D. (2012). Perspectives on learning, thinking, and activity. *Educational Researcher, 29*(4), 11-13.

Brown, D., G. (2015). *Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area*. Copenhagen, Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation, 431-454

Burns, A. (2012). Teacher beliefs and their influence on classroom practice. *Prospect 7*(3), 56–66