



RESEARCH PAPER\]

Investigating the Challenges Faced by Pakistani EFL Teachers: A Literature Review

Muhammad Younas*¹ Beenish Pervaiz ² Saira Maqbool ³

1. Assistant Professor, Department of English, Higher Education Department, Govt. of Punjab, Pakistan
2. Lecturer, University of Education Lahore (Jauharabad Campus), Punjab, Pakistan
3. Assistant Professor, Department of English, AIOU, Islamabad, Pakistan

DOI [http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022\(6-II\)74](http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022(6-II)74)

PAPER INFO	ABSTRACT
Received: March 03, 2022	The purpose of this study is to develop theoretical foundation in form of literature review for the researchers for empirical analysis in this field. This paper points out the problems that are being faced by English Language Teachers working in Pakistan. The study is qualitative in nature. A Lot of literature has been read by the researchers to find out the challenges and problems being faced by the employees of different organizations. The researchers have listed out the commonly faced challenges by the employees in several organizations. The commonly faced problems are absence of job satisfaction, absence of job autonomy, absence of job security, absence of workplace flexibility, absence of handsome salary and the conducive leadership style, problems in using full potential and absence of knowledge sharing and knowledge receiving environment. 25 EFL teachers working in different educational organizations who were willing to be the part of study have been interviewed through convenience sampling. The structure interview was administered to validate either the challenges investigated from the literature review are found or not among EFL teachers of educational organizations. The data collected through structured interview has been analysed through thematic analysis. Finally, the emerging themes corresponded to the listed-out challenges from the review of literature.
Accepted: June 21, 2022	
Online: June 23, 2022	
Keywords: English Language Teachers Job Satisfaction, Knowledge Sharing, The Conducive Leadership Style	
*Corresponding Author younusdaniel@gmail.com	

Introduction

This paper highlights different problems faced by English Language Teachers in Pakistan. This paper gives insight via the literature view to enable empirical research related to the difficulties in the way of English Language Teachers across Pakistan. Extensive studies relative to the problems faced by the workers in an organization are carried out. The employees face a variety of difficulties while performing their jobs. The most prevalent issues are discussed in this study based on the data collected and arranged from structured interviews with EFL teachers teaching in various institutions. The most common problems are lack of job satisfaction and less job autonomy, rigidity in workplaces, missing attractive job

packages, absence of job security along with a less conducive leadership style in the organization. This leads to the strains in the creation of a learning environment. The studies show that a conducive leadership style improves job performance. The intellectual and moral uplift of leaders is necessary for the effective working of an organization. Of the most popular leadership styles, democratic leadership is the best where the employees are included in the decision-making process of an organization. Furthermore, transformational leaders are more sympathetic to employees' needs and thereby, job motivation and performance are encouraged. Besides leadership, job autonomy plays an important role in the effectiveness and performance of an organization. Researchers have found that job autonomy directly contributes to job satisfaction (Dawson, 1987). Moreover, fairness in an organization yields the effectiveness of all employees. Fairness also includes the idea that all employees are treated equally in terms of rewards and punishments (Lawler and Porter, 1967). Moreover, this research indicates that job satisfaction is directly related to higher wages and job security. This study also reflects the problems associated with EFL teachers, particularly in Pakistan. The current working environment does not allow them to fully utilize their abilities and skills. The foremost reasons for this situation are the lack of independence, creativity, and strained availability and exposure to technology. Even more, Lin (2008) demonstrates that the sharing of knowledge from one individual to other individuals within the organization is the sine qua non for its success. Whereas the prevailing environment and structure of Pakistan's educational institutions provide little room for knowledge sharing and creativity. This aspect of constrained knowledge-sharing is aggravated by the lack of socialization practices when it comes to learning. Nonetheless, these problems can be mitigated by the adoption of certain practices from top to bottom levels as depicted in the recommendation section.

Literature Review

Kalleberg, (1977) suggests that job satisfaction includes two components. These are intrinsic (referring to the work itself) and extrinsic (representing the facets of the job external to the task itself) job satisfaction. (Lashbrook, 1997) is of the view that leadership style plays an important role in influencing the employees' job satisfaction. (Bogler, 2001) demonstrates that the different leadership styles engender different working environment and directly influence employees' job satisfaction.

Emery, (2007) state that the transformational leaders encourage their followers to take on more responsibility and it increases employees' sense of accomplishment and job satisfaction. Castaneda and Nahavandi (1991) indicate that the employees are more satisfied with both relational and task-oriented behaviours exhibiting simultaneously by their heads. (Sternberg, 1997) refers to job satisfaction in terms of how people feel about their jobs and different aspects of their jobs. Ellickson and Logsdon (2002) support this view by defining job satisfaction as the extent to which employees like their work. (Schermerhorn, 1993) defines job satisfaction as an affective or emotional response towards various aspects of an employee's work. (C.R.Reilly, 1991) defines job satisfaction as the feeling that a worker has about his job or a general attitude towards work or a job and it is influenced by the perception of one's job. J.P. Wanous and E.E. Lawler (1972) refers job satisfaction is the sum of job facet satisfaction across all facets of a job. (Abraham

Maslow, 1954) suggested that human needs from a five-level hierarchy ranging from physiological needs, safety, belongingness and love, esteem to self-actualization. Based on Maslow's theory, job satisfaction has been approached by some researchers from the perspective of need fulfilment (Kuhlen, 1963; Worf, 1970; Conrad et al., 1985). Herzberg's Two Factor Theory encompasses factors that cause satisfaction and dissatisfaction among employees. According to this theory, quality of work, pay, physical working conditions and job security are the factors associated with dissatisfaction of the employees. He uses the term 'motivators' for the factors like opportunities for promotion and personal growth, recognition, responsibility and achievement that increase the job satisfaction of the employees. (Greenberg and Baron, 2003: p. 153). There is another theory named Value Theory. This theory is about the job reward. According to this theory, the key to employees' job satisfaction is to minimize discrepancy between employees' desires and job rewards (Greenberg and Baron, 2003: p. 153-154). Better human resource management practices also play a vital role in enhancing the employees' job satisfaction (Bloom and Van Reenen, 2007 and Petrescu and Simmons, 2008).

Job Security, Job Autonomy, Workplace Flexibility, Handsome Salary and Leadership Style

English Language Teachers also face some problems due to the absence of Job Security, Job Autonomy, Workplace Flexibility, Handsome Salary and Leadership Style. Leadership directly influences the performance of employees. If the leadership is conducive for employees, the employees' performance will be improved. Leadership is a way to influence the groups' behaviour and direct them towards achieving the defined goals. (Robbins, 2003, P314). There have been discussions about leadership and leaders since man started working in group. Leader can be defined as a person who has managerial authority and who can influence others. Leadership is simply what the leader does. Leaders should have the qualities like drive, desire to lead, honesty and integrity, self confidence, intelligence, job-relevant knowledge, and extraversion.

Leaders influence the behaviour, feelings, and performance of their subordinates. Performance of subordinates is improved if they are positively influenced by their leaders. Research had been made to explore the leadership styles to find the most effective one for both the quality and quantity of work. The autocratic style, the democratic style and laissez-faire style and their impact on employees' performance have been deeply researched. In autocratic leadership, work methods are dictated to the employees not involving them in decision making process. In laissez-faire leadership, the leaders let the group make decisions and complete the work in whatever way it saw fit. In democratic leadership style, the employees are involved in decision making.

It is concluded that democratic style is the most effective to make employees' performance better. Recently, the research is being made to investigate the influences of transactional and transformational leadership on employees' performance. Burns, J.M. (1978) opines that transactional and transformational leadership styles are more prominent among leadership styles. Transactional leaders give rewards and punishments to encourage performance, making the leader/ worker relationship

essentially an economic transaction. (Bass, 1985). Transactional Leaders work with their team members exchanging rewards with them and being responsive to their immediate interests. Transformational leaders are active leaders that have four distinguishing qualities: charisma, inspiration, intellectual stimulation, and individualized consideration. (Bass, 1985 & Conger, 1999). Charisma is the extent of pride, faith and respect leaders encourage their workers to have in themselves, their leaders, and their organizations. Inspiration is the ability to motivate followers through communication of high expectations. Intellectual stimulation is the frequency with which leaders encourage employees to be innovative in their problem solutions. Finally, individualized consideration is the degree of personal attention and encouragement of self-development a leader imparts to the employees. (Bass, 1985 & Bass, 1990). Conducive leadership style creates eagerness among employees to achieve the goals with sincerity and it also brings satisfaction among employees (Aydin and Ceylan, 2009). Lee and Ho, (1989) are of the view that the employees are more satisfied if they are involved in decision making by the leadership. (Tanke, 1990) states that unpleasant behaviour of the leader creates dissatisfaction among the employees and even the employees may leave the organization. Markow and Klenke (2005) and (Milliman et al., 2003) point out that the pleasant behaviour of the leadership can enhance the efficiency and job satisfaction of the employee.

The term job autonomy refers to the state of the self-governing of the people (Smith, 1993). Job autonomy is one the important factors that enhances the employees' job satisfaction (Dawson, 1987). Job autonomy is one of the key factors that plays a vital role for the job satisfaction of the employees (Nguyen et al, 2003) Person's job is more than some obvious activities. The factors like the nature of work, supervision, present pay, and promotion opportunities bring satisfaction among employees (Robbins, 2003). (Hackman, 1990) is of the view that intrinsic as well as extrinsic rewards play an important role for employees' satisfaction. (James Brown, 2007) defines the fairness as equal treatment in which all the employees receive same benefits rendering the same services as other employees in the organization. Lepper and Green (1978) state that the employees experience greater satisfaction in the situations where the probability of making endogenous attributions is higher than the probability of making exogenous attributions. Lawler and Porter (1967) opine that the performance of the employees will be increased if they get proper reward of their efforts. They further state that if the employees' rewards are inequitable to their co-workers, it will result dissatisfaction. (Adams, 1963) expresses that the employees are dissatisfied if the rewards will not match their efforts. Podsakoff (1982) gives his view that employees are more satisfied when they receive just rewards after their performances. (Hackman, 1976) demonstrates that the employees perform better with satisfaction if they will be favoured. (Herman, 1973) is of the view that the economic conditions affect job satisfaction-performance relationship. Miller (1982) explains that job security and higher pay are important factors that bring job satisfaction. Furnham (1992) categorizes the factors that can have impact on job satisfaction into three categories: organizational policies and procedures, working conditions at workplace and personal issues of employees. (Robbins, 1998) gives his opinion that flexible work situations and supportive work environments bring satisfaction among employees and increase their performance.

Utility of Full Potential

English Language Teachers confront some problems as far as the use of knowledge is concerned. Siddiqui, S. (2007) opines that the assessment system deeply influences the educational set-up of Pakistan. It does not allow the teachers to utilize their potential for using their knowledge. It is also concluded that nothing has been done to improve this system. Burgess et al, (2002) and Fisher, R. (2004) conclude that prescriptive curriculum and tightly defined assessment system damage teachers' professional autonomy and creativity. Teachers are no independent in their teaching so they cannot use knowledge independently. They have to seek permission from higher authorities at every step. Hanke, V. (2002) believes that if the curriculum and assessment system are not flexible for the teachers, the natural potential for use of knowledge will be constrained. Scholte J.A. (2001) demonstrates that the teachers must enhance the competitive abilities of their students by using number of technologies. In this way the learning of students can be made better. It becomes necessary to have well equipped classroom for using technologies. Less equipped classrooms cannot provide an environment in which the teachers can use their knowledge with ease. Here in Pakistan, lack of resources is an obstacle in making classrooms well-equipped. Crystal D. (2001) suggests that the teacher should adjust their curriculum plans to meet the demands of society. But the situation in Pakistan is quite pathetic as far as the curriculum is concerned. The prescriptive curriculum does not allow the teachers to use their knowledge independently. The teachers are always bound to follow this well- defined curriculum. So, this situation is a hurdle for teachers to use their knowledge in classrooms. Heller, M. (2005) agrees that the decentralization and deregulation of English curricula makes the schools and teachers more autonomous in using knowledge. But in Pakistan, nothing has been done to change the curricula, so the teachers are unable to use their knowledge freely. (Smith, 2008) says that the institutions are becoming autonomous in developing curriculum. In this way, teachers are free to teach whatever they want according to the taste of students. But in Pakistan, teachers are still bound to teach according to prescriptive curriculum. It hampers the teachers to use their knowledge. Al-Otaibi (2004) is of the view that motivated learners can pay high cost and even make sacrifices to achieve their goals in learning foreign language. It was also found that motivated learners can learn language more effectively. The assumption can be made that de-motivated students themselves are a great hurdle for teachers in using knowledge.

Knowledge Sharing and Knowledge Receiving

Absence of knowledge sharing and knowledge receiving environment causes problems for English Language Teachers. (Leonard-Barton, 1995) gives his opinion that an organization is both the storage of knowledge and creator of knowledge at the same time. Storage of knowledge is in form of employees replete with unique skills and expertise and some formal knowledge in the explicit form. Knowledge creation starts after knowledge sharing. Shared knowledge of employees puts forward solutions to problems faced by an organization. Problem solving is one of major knowledge creating activities. The positive role of an organization is very important in the effective process of knowledge sharing and knowledge creation

process. Nonaka& Takeuchi (1997) are of the view in their knowledge conversion model that knowledge creation happens when there is the interaction between explicit and tacit knowledge. Knowledge conversion activities include externalization, internalization, combination, and socialization. Nonaka& Takeuchi (1995) also explain in their SECI model that tacit knowledge gets converted into tacit knowledge by sharing experiences. Tsai and Ghoshal (1998) demonstrate that the interaction built through socialization among the employees of the organizations facilitates the knowledge sharing activities. So, it can be concluded that the absence of socialization in the organization hinders the knowledge sharing and knowledge creation process. (Lin, 2008) explains that knowledge sharing behaviour of employees in organizations very is very important to transfer the knowledge of an individual to many individuals to make the organizations successful. (Jiacheng et al, 2012) agree that knowledge sharing behaviour among employees creates cooperation for mapping out the fortunes of the organization. (Szulanski, 1996) suggests that some individuals are unwilling to share their knowledge because they feel that it will bring others to their level and their promotions will be disturbed. (Abrams et al., 2003 p.65) point out that "trust leads to increase overall knowledge exchange, makes knowledge exchanges less costly, and increases the likelihood that knowledge acquired from a colleague is sufficiently understood and absorbed that a person can put it to use." (Tsai, 2002) gives his view that decentralized structure of the organization promotes communication and causes increase in employees' motivation and satisfaction. (Damanpour, 1999) considers decentralized structure of the organization facilitative to the success of knowledge management activities and methods.

Material and Methods

The research has been conducted with adherence to its principles. The upright notions of neutrality, reliability, validity, and generalization have been strictly followed. The research is qualitative and analytical in nature. Qualitative research has helped to form the theoretical framework of the issue. The data obtained was mainly through communication and open-ended sources. The one-on-one interview methodology has been used to grasp deep knowledge about the issue. Whereas the analytical approach has been applied to deeply examine the prevailing circumstances. The non-probability sampling (convenient) is done with 25 EFL teachers who willingly participated in the research. Convenience sampling is the easiest way to conduct sampling which included the willingness of the participants.

Population

The study's target population was English Language Teachers working in Pakistan.

Techniques for Sampling

The structured interviews were conducted with the participation of EFL teachers. The technique of convenient sampling has been used in this study. The number of participants involved in this study is 25.

Results and Discussions

This study has found several challenges in the way EFL teachers teach in Pakistan. The obvious hurdles in the way of EFL teachers as discussed above are found while interviewing 25 EFL teachers. The absence of job satisfaction is the primary and foremost problem in the education system of Pakistan faced by the teachers. As shown above, job satisfaction is necessary to ensure the effective performance of the employees. Several steps are needed to mitigate this worse condition. The rigidity in organizational structure adds fuel to the fire. In the same way, an unhealthy leadership style is another stone in the path of dedicated teachers which must be substituted by conducive leadership. The absence of job security force the teachers to strict with other activities to ensure safe future. Fairness and impartiality play an important role in the success of any organization. Education institutes must incorporate these elements to ensure performance and fruitful outcomes. Moreover, the research has found that the absence of creativity impedes the growth of teachers. Therefore, certain measures are needed to be taken so that the situation may get better. Foremost, teachers must be consulted by the top hierarchy of the institutions so that they may incorporate fruitful and practical ideas to yield better results. The earnings of EFL teachers are not on par when compared with international EFL teachers. The responsible organizations must ensure attractive salaries to attract the best talent. In the same way, creativity and growth is an important element which is under behemoth pressure. Decisions should be made in terms of curriculum and general teaching methodologies to ensure creativity, growth and development. In this way, EFL teachers can utilize their full potential while teaching the students.

Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to point out English Language Teachers' problems. The problems that English Language Teachers face have been investigated in this study. English Language Teachers face some problems due to the absence of Job Security, Job Autonomy, Workplace Flexibility, Handsome Salary and Leadership Style. Absence of the environment that is conducive to knowledge sharing, knowledge creation and knowledge use causes many problems for English Language Teachers. It can be suggested that problems of EFL teachers may be alleviated by addressing the highlighted problems.

Recommendations

The way forward to these challenges lies in taking concrete measures. The job performance is directly based on the working environment surrounding the EFL teachers. Higher authorities must strive to provide job security, working autonomy and flexibility, attractive salary and cooperative leadership. This is the only way forward to keep pace with the world. The importance of the English language is known to all. We are living in a world where most of our knowledge is in the English language. Besides this, international markets, trends, and transactions use the English language. Therefore, no nation can dare to progress without specializing in the

English language. Institutions must ensure a creative and growing environment where knowledge-sharing and creative values are pursued.

References

- Abrams, L. C., Cross, R., Lesser, E., & Levin, D. Z. (2003). Nurturing interpersonal trust in knowledge-sharing networks, *17(4)*, 64-77.
- Bass, B.M. (1985). *Leadership and performance beyond expectation*. New York. Free Press.
- Bass, B.M. (1990). *Bass & Stodgill's handbook of leadership: Theory, research and managerial applications*, New York, Free Press.
- Bloom, N. V. & Reenen, J. (2007). Measuring and explaining management practices across firms and countries, *Quart. J. Econ.* 122(4), 1351 - 1408.
- Bogler, R. (2001). The influence of leadership style on teacher job satisfaction. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 37(5), 662-683.
- Burgess, T. , Fox, C. , & Goody, J. (2002). *When the Hurly Burly's Done: What's Worth Fighting for in English in Education*, Sheffield, National Association for Teaching of English.
- Burns, J.M. (1978). *Leadership*. New York, Harper & Row.
- Castaneda, M. & Nahavandi, A. (1991). Link of manager behavior to supervisor performance rating and subordinate satisfaction. *Group and Organization Management*, 16(4), 357-366. <https://doi.org/10.1177/105960119101600402>
- Reilly, C. R. (1991). Organizational Behavior. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 427- 458
- Conger, J. A. (1999). Charismatic and transformational leadership in organizations: An insider's perspective on these developing streams of research. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 10(2), 145-179. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843\(99\)00012-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1048-9843(99)00012-0)
- Dawson, P. (1987). Computer technology and the job of the First-Line Supervisor. *New Technology, Work and Employment*, 2(1), 47-60.
- Damanpour, F. (1991), Organizational innovation: a meta-analysis of effects of determinants and moderators. *Academic Management Journal*, 34(3), 555-9. <https://doi.org/10.5465/256406>
- Emery, C.R. & Barker, K.J. (2007). The effect of transactional and transformational leadership styles on the organizational commitment and job satisfaction of customer contact personnel. *Journal of Organizational Culture, Communication & Conflict*, 11(1), 77-90.
- Furnham, A. (2002). *Personality at Work : Individual Differences in the Workplace*. *Personality at Work*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203134122>
- Hackman, J. R. (1990). *Groups That Work and Those that Don't*. San Francisco, Jossey Bass.

- Herman, J.(1973). Are situational contingencies limiting job attitude- job performance relationship? *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 10, 208-224.
- Hanke, V. (2002). Improvisations around the National Literacy Strategy. *Reading*, 36(2), 80-87. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9345.00191>.
- Heller, M. (2005) *Linguistic Minorities and Modernity: A sociolinguistic Ethnography*. London: Longman.
- Robert, A. & Baron, A. R. *Behavior in Organizations: Understanding and Managing The Human Side of Work*, Prentice Hall, New Jersey, 2003.
- Kalleberg, A.L. (1977). Work values and job rewards: a theory of job satisfaction. *American Sociological Review*, 42, 124-143.
- Lashbrook, W.(1997). Business performance, employee satisfaction and leadership practices. *Performance Improvement*, 36(5), 29-33. <https://doi.org/10.1002/PFI.4140360508>.
- Lawler, E. & Porter, L. (1967). The effect of performance on job satisfaction. *Industrial Relations*, 7(2), 20-28.
- Lepper, M., & Greene, D. (2015). *The hidden costs of reward: New perspectives on the psychology of human motivation*. <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/mono/10.4324/9781315666983/hidden-costs-reward-mark-lepper-david-greene>
- Lee, E. Ho, H. (1989). Quality of work life the case of Hong Kong, Working Paper Series, Hong Kong Baptist College, *Business Research Center*, Hong Kong.
- Locke, E.A. (1976). *The nature and causes of job satisfaction*. In M.D. Dunnette (ed), *Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology*, Chicago, IL: Rand McNally, 1297-1349.
- Lin, C. P. (2007). To share or not to share: Modeling tacit knowledge sharing, its mediators and antecedents. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 70(4), 411-428. <https://doi.org/10.1007/S10551-006-9119-0>
- Maslow, A.H. (1955). Motivation and personality. *Journal of Consulting Psychology*, 19(1). <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0039764> Adams, J. S. (1963). Towards an understanding of inequity. *The Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*, 67(5), 422-436. <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0040968>
- Markow, F., & Klenke, K. (2005). The effects of personal meaning and calling on organizational commitment: An empirical investigation of spiritual leadership. *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 13(1), 8-27. <https://doi.org/10.1108/EB028995/FULL/HTML>

- Miller, J. (1980). Individual and Occupational Determinants of Job Satisfaction: A Focus On Gender Differences. *Work and Occupations*, 7(3), 337-366. <https://doi.org/10.1177/073088848000700304>
- Milliman, J., Czaplewski, A. J., & Ferguson, J. (2003). Workplace spirituality and employee work attitudes: An exploratory empirical assessment. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 16(4), 426-447. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09534810310484172/FULL/XML>
- Nguyen, A. Taylor, J. & Bradley, S. (2003). *Relative pay and job satisfaction: some new evidence*, Munich Personal RePEc Archive. (n.d.). Retrieved June 24, 2022, <https://mpa.ub.uni-muenchen.de/1382/>
- Robbins, S.P. (2003). *Organizational behavior: Where we've been, where we're going*. Mit.Edu.https://web.mit.edu/curhan/www/docs/Articles/15341_Readings/OB_Introduction_Overview/OReilly_OB_Where_weve_been_and_where_were_going.pdf
- Scholte, J.A. (2001). "The Globalization of world politics" in *The Globalization of World politics*.(eds). By Baylis.J. & Smith. S. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Seligman, L. G. (1980). Leadership. *American Political Science Review*, 74(1), 153-156. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1955659>
- Smith, L. E. (2016). English as an International Auxiliary Language, 7(2), 38-42. <https://doi.org/10.1177/003368827600700205>
- Siddiqui, S. (2007). *Rethinking Education in Pakistan: Perceptions, Practices, and Possibilities*. Lahore, Paramount Publishing Press.
- Sternberg, R. J. (1999). The Theory of Successful Intelligence, 3(4), 292-316. <https://doi.org/10.1037/1089-2680.3.4.292>
- Szulanski, G. (1996). Exploring internal stickiness: impediments to the transfer of best practice within the firm. *Strategic Management Journal*, 17, 27-43.
- Tsai, W. (2002). Social structure of "coopetition" within a multiunit organization: Coordination, competition, and intraorganizational knowledge sharing. *Organization Science*, 13(2), 179-190. <https://doi.org/10.1287/ORSC.13.2.179.536>
- Tsai, W., & Ghoshal, S. (1998). Social Capital and Value Creation: The Role of Intrafirm Networks. *Academy of Management Journal*, 41(4), 464-476. <https://doi.org/10.5465/257085>